Proposed Implementation strategy:

Status of Women Academics College of Earth and Mineral Sciences, June 2017

Updated: 3-26-18

Prepared by Sub-committee of the EMS Executive Council:

Yvette Richardson

Victoria Sanchez

David Stensrud

Ann Taylor

Proposed Implementation strategy: Status of Women Academics College of Earth and Mineral Sciences, June 2017

Executive Summary

Priority Level	Item
Must-Do: Key actions, regardless of cost or difficulty in implementation. These items form the foundation.	
	7.2 EMS leadership is encouraged to communicate diversity and inclusion priorities regularly and visibly to the entire College.
	3.5 Train those responsible for reviewing candidates for promotion in implicit bias
	3.5-1 Conduct implicit bias training for at least ½ hour in department faculty meeting annually
	3.2-1 Hold an orientation for eligible post-tenure faculty to provide information about the process for promotion to full professor.
	3.2-2. Hold post-tenure review discussions every 3 years to establish a plan for promotion and follow progress
	3.3-2 Hold workshops to clarify expectations and process for promotion within non-tenure ranks
	4.2-1 Include mentoring activities in Annual Activity Report to formally recognize mentoring
	7.2-2 Conduct a comprehensive college climate survey
	2.1-1 Establish a new grant fund to focus on newer faculty, especially those just beyond the start-up period or after tenure/promotion
	6.2 Clearly communicate and strongly enforce Penn State's zero tolerance policy for all forms of sexual harassment.
Priority Level 1: relatively simple, already in progress, short-term implementation, minimal or no cost. Time Frame for initiating: 2017-18	
	1.1 Educate leadership in all units to have a greater awareness of diversity concerns
	1.2-5 Create post-doc positions to pipeline women into tenure track positions
	1.3 Advocate for University funds for targeted hiring.
	1.4 Advocate for University assistance for dual career hires.
	1.5-1 Broad job descriptions and diversity, equity, and inclusion statement in job description to encourage diverse pool
	1.5-2 Proactive advertisement positions to a diverse pool of potential candidates
	3.1 Provide clear and open communication about promotion expectations, especially to full professor and within non-tenure track ranks.
	3.1-1 Clarify "unwritten expectations" for promotion to full professor.
	3.1-2 Revise template for promotion to full professor for consistency.
	3.1-3 Ensure that website is up to date
	3.3 Clarify and share information about expectations and process for non-tenure track faculty promotion
	3.3-1 Provide information about the University's new third level of non-tenure track faculty
	3.3-3 Actively identify those who may be eligible
	5.1 Ensure that all policies are transparent and easily available to all
Priority Level 2: Somewhat complex, may need college coordination and resources,	
	1.2 Ensure gender balance in hiring with tenure.
	1.2-1 Examine data on past hires
	1.2-2 Examine reasons why tenure track faculty have departed
	1.2-3 Consider prioritizing junior candidates
	1.2-4 Consider recruiting successful women faculty from other institutions

may need coordination with University offices, longer-term implementation, some costs. Time Frame for initiating: 2018-19	1.5 Develop a search and hiring protocol aimed at increasing faculty diversity.
	1.5-3 Required implicit bias training for faculty serving on search committees
	2.4 Train members of early tenure ranks to empower them as leaders within EMS and their respective disciplines to promote excellence
	2.4-1 Encourage participation in faculty development programs offered by Office of Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs etc.
	2.4-2 Encourage participation in Penn State leadership courses.
	2.4-3 Develop a list of topics that assistant and associate professors should be exposed to.
	2.4-4 Provide a list of trainings offered by OHR and SITE with topics that are relevant to faculty development.
	3.2 Provide regular opportunities for constructive feedback and informing faculty about their progress towards advancements.
	3.2-3 Encourage department P&T committees to regularly identify those potentially eligible for promotion to full and solicit their materials
	3.4 Ensure that review of P&T candidates focuses on quality and quantity of scholarly products (not time since degree or hire).
	4.1 Establish greater accountability from department and unit leaders for consistent enforcement of College best practices for mentoring
	4.1-2 Elevate the mentoring award by including a plaque or other recognition and media coverage
	4.2-2 Provide greater clarity on what activities contribute to formal and especially to informal mentoring.
	4.3 College leadership should be attentive to subtle behaviors or incivility between colleagues and should clearly communicate to all faculty that such behaviors will not be tolerated.
	4.5 Hold informal gatherings focus on new faculty, recognitions, promotions and mentoring
	4.6 Hold yearly group meetings of assistant professors, associate professors, and FT faculty to socialize with the dean.
	5.4 Recognize those who do contribute their time to governance activities, include in annual faculty activity report.
	6.1 Implement effective reporting, investigation, education, and enforcement policies for sexual harassment.
	7.1-1 Invest in a staff position to enable the acquisition and analysis of EMS and benchmark data
	7.1-2 Include facility with data and data resources as a competency for any staff hire
	7.2-1 Issue an annual “state of EMS diversity” report
Priority Level 3: More complex, need college coordination and resources, may need collaboration with Penn State offices, longer-term implementation, some costs. Time Frame: 2019-20 and beyond.	
	1.2-6 Examine data to identify any salary inequities
	2.1 Support professional development that enhances scholarship
	2.1-2 Prioritize collaborative projects; offer in-house sabbatical (teaching reduction) to foster time for collaborations
	2.2 Offer training and support to help faculty adjust to changing federal funding trends and build skills for alternative funding
	2.3 Establish a program to support faculty following major transitions
	4.1-1 Develop a mentoring program that crosses departments in the college
	4.2 Ensure that both formal service responsibilities and informal service work are equitably distributed, recognized, and rewarded.
	4.4 Include in Faculty Activity reports formal recognition of efforts by faculty that build organizational citizenship
	5.2 Ensure that female faculty are paid equitably to their male peers and that they have access to the same space, resources, promotion, and recognition as their male peers.
	5.3 Address faculty workload stress

Report Recommendation	Report details	Notes	Recommended implementation	Responsibility	Updates/status/outcomes
1. Continue efforts to hire pre-tenure women; strive for gender balance among faculty hired with tenure.	*The elevated departure rates for tenured women and the substantially high proportion of men hired with tenure kept the percentage of tenured women below 20% in 2016, and kept the net gain of tenured women to less than 3% through the decade.* *The College should consider carefully the many-fold reasons and the long-term implications of decisions that lead to over representation of women in fixed-term appointments.*	Examine previous hires with tenure to better understand the individual situations and trends that may contribute to the gender imbalance.	1.1 Educate leadership in all units to have a greater awareness of diversity concerns (including how minority women may experience gender bias differently than majority women).	Department/institute heads, Dean	Regular discussions in executive council • Updates on report and implementation plan • College environmental climate survey • EMS reads/Claude Steele
			1.2 Ensure gender balance in hiring with tenure. • 1.2-1 Examine data on past hires • 1.2-2 Examine reasons why tenure track faculty have departed • 1.2-3 Consider prioritizing junior candidates (prior to women and URM candidates dropping out of the pipeline) • 1.2-4 Consider recruiting successful women faculty from other institutions • 1.2-5 Create post-doc positions to pipeline women into tenure track positions (perhaps matched by college) • 1.2-6 Examine data to identify any salary inequities	Department heads, Dean	College Post-doc program established, to start fall 2018

			1.3 Advocate for University funds for targeted hiring. 1.4 Advocate for University assistance for dual career hires.	Dean, based on recommendation from Department heads Provost, Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs, AVP for Faculty HR	
			1.5 Develop a search and hiring protocol aimed at increasing faculty diversity. A few key elements would include: • 1.5-1 Broad job descriptions and diversity, equity, and inclusion statement in job description to encourage diverse pool • 1.5-2 Proactive advertisement positions to a diverse pool of potential candidates (formal and informal) • 1.5-3 Required implicit bias training for faculty serving on search committees (including intersection of gender and race/ethnicity)	OADEE, OHR, Diversity Council, Affirmative Action Office, with Dean's approval Diversity Council: develop and Organize implicit bias training for faculty serving on search committees Affirmative Action Office Search Committee Briefing is adding more on implicit bias	• Working with AAO to enhance search committee training • Established common DE&I language for all job posts (Penn State and external posts), and ask that candidates discuss their diversity experience in their application materials • Developed list of effective job boards for diversity

2. Focus resources on professional development measures to support the success of all faculty, and to help retain tenured women.	*The committee encourage organizers of all speaking venues to be attentive to gender representation among speakers invited to present their work to EMS audiences.* *The committee strongly urges the College to address factors that contribute to feelings of isolation by all faculty.* *The majority of women at all ranks, and*	Retention of tenured women is a priority. Retention of pre-tenure and non-tenure track faculty (Fixed Term and Research) is also of concern. Ensure ample resources for addressing this recommendation. Ensure that women faculty feel valued.	2.1 Support professional development that enhances scholarship (travel support to professional workshops, meetings, research opportunities, training opportunities) • 2.1-1 Establish a new grant fund to focus on newer faculty, especially those just beyond the start-up period, those newly tenured, and/or those who don't otherwise have funding support for these activities (endowment) • 2.1-2 Prioritize collaborative projects; offer in-house sabbatical (teaching reduction) to foster time for collaborations	Dean, Associate Deans, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR	

	especially tenured women, have considered leaving EMS.		2.2 Offer training and support to help faculty adjust to changing federal funding trends and build skills for seeking funding from other sources such as foundations and philanthropic entities.	Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR, ADGER	
			2.3 Establish a program to support faculty following major transitions (including significant professional transitions such as stepping down from major administrative responsibilities), such as small grants and course release	Dean, Associate Deans, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR	

			2.4 Train members of early tenure ranks to empower them as leaders within EMS and their respective disciplines to promote excellence in research, teaching, and service. • 2.4-1 Encourage participation in faculty development programs offered by Office of Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs and other Penn State programs • 2.4-2 Encourage participation in Penn State leadership courses. • 2.4-3 Develop a list of topics that assistant and associate professors should be exposed to. • 2.4-4 Provide a list of trainings offered by OHR and SITE with topics that are relevant to faculty development.	Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR Office of the Vice Provost for Faculty Affairs, OHR Workplace Learning and Performance	

3. Clarify promotion expectations and provide more promotion-relevant feedback for associate professors and for non-tenure-line faculty who are eligible for promotion.	*The timing for promotion to professor from associate professor is suggested in HR 23 to be 6 years, but as shown in Table 7, the duration can be quite a bit longer for a significant number of faculty.* *Associate professors have the least agreement about clarity of promotion expectations and constructive feedback*	Clarifying promotion expectations is a priority. There are many unwritten expectations for promotion to full, and the template is contradictory.	3.1 Provide clear and open communication about promotion expectations, especially for promotion to full professor and promotion within non-tenure track ranks. • 3.1-1 Clarify "unwritten expectations" for promotion to full professor. • 3.1-2 Revise template for promotion to full professor for consistency. • 3.1-3 Ensure that website is up to date	Faculty Advisory Committee, Fixed Term and Research Committee, HR, P&T Committees (College and departments), Department heads, EMS Marketing and Communications	Promotion to full guidelines are being updated for consistency (fall 2017). FAC is updating the Five Year Faculty Performance Evaluation process (2017-18) FT&R FAC is working on clarification and processes around AC21 New EMS Website
			3.2 Provide regular opportunities for constructive feedback and informing faculty about their progress towards advancements. • 3.2-1 Hold an orientation for eligible post-tenure faculty to provide information about the process for promotion to full professor. • 3.2-2. Hold post-tenure review discussions every 3 years to establish a plan for promotion and follow progress • 3.2-3 Encourage departments P&T committees to regularly identify those potentially eligible for promotion to full and solicit their	Faculty Advisory Committee, HR, P&T Committees (College and departments), Department heads.	

			materials, perhaps through the post-tenure review process		
			3.3 Clarify and share information about expectations and process for non-tenure track faculty promotion • 3.3-1 Provide information about the University's new third level of non-tenure track faculty • 3.3-2 Hold workshops to clarify expectations and process for promotion within non-tenure ranks • 3.3-3 Actively identify those who may be eligible	Fixed Term and Research Faculty Advisory Committee, HR, Department Heads.	November 2017: FT&R Committee "AC23 FT&R Faculty Promotion Policy (EMS Supplement to AC23)" in relation to AC21 "Definition of Academic Ranks", presented to EC spring 2018

			3.4 Ensure that review of P&T candidates focuses on quality and quantity of scholarly products (not time since degree or hire).	Faculty Advisory Committee, HR, P&T Committees (College and departments), Department heads.	
			3.5 Train those responsible for reviewing candidates for promotion in implicit bias (including in their own thinking and in other forms such as letters of recommendation, SRTE scores, and written teaching evaluations) • 3.5-1 Conduct implicit bias training for at least ½ hour in department faculty meeting annually	ADEE, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR, Diversity Council Diversity Council: organize and carry out training	Working with AAO to develop training for review committees METO, EME, and GEOSCI have conducted implicit bias training in faculty meetings

4. Foster faculty citizenship by formally valuing mentoring and other efforts that enable the success of others.	*Perceptions were moderate-to-low for all faculty regarding adequate resources and access to professional development and mentoring, and this was especially the case for faculty in the pre-tenure rank.* All departments should check to be sure teaching and service responsibilities are clearly and equitably distributed among pre-tenure faculty. In particular, units should make sure that	See additional report notes below regarding climate and isolation. Reducing feelings of isolation and increasing feelings or collegiality and connectedness with department/institute and college is a priority	4.1 Establish greater accountability from department and unit leaders for consistent enforcement of College best practices for mentoring for both tenure track and non-tenure track faculty. • 4.1-1 Develop a mentoring program that crosses departments in the college so that a new faculty member would be matched with one mentor from within the department and a second mentor from another department in EMS (applicable to both tenure/tenure track and FT faculty) • 4.1-2 Elevate the mentoring award by including a plaque or other recognition and media coverage (including college video bulletin boards)	Dean, HR, Department Heads/Institute Directors	

	pre-tenure women faculty are not excessively asked to participate in service relative to their male peers, as this is a well-recognized and common occurrence in academic communities. The support of peers and especially supervisors can go a long way to mitigate negative consequences of discriminatory behaviors… that can denigrate individuals and cause social isolation		4.2 Ensure that both formal service responsibilities and informal service work (such as providing emotional, academic, or career support for students, etc.) are equitably distributed, recognized, and rewarded. • 4.2-1 Include mentoring activities in Annual Activity Report. To formally recognize mentoring in merit review processes for all faculty. • 4.2-2 Provide greater clarity on what activities contribute to formal and especially to informal mentoring.	Dean, Department Heads/Institute Directors	Will be included in 2018 Faculty Activity Reports
			4.3 College leadership should be attentive to subtle behaviors or incivility between colleagues and should clearly communicate to all faculty that such behaviors will not be tolerated.	Dean, Department Heads/Institute Directors (training is needed, insight from climate study will be helpful in identifying problem areas and areas doing well)	

			4.4 Include in Faculty Activity reports formal recognition of efforts by faculty that build organizational citizenship (including activities that strengthen inclusion and diversity, and those that lower intellectual and cultural isolation within and between units). Applicable to both tenure/tenure track and Fixed Term and Research faculty.	Dean Diversity Council could work with FAC and FT&RFAC to help develop this mechanism and metrics	
			4.5 Hold informal gatherings in different spaces (Steidle Atrium, Weather Center, Museum Gallery), catered and with wine, and with nametags indicating name and department. Gatherings could focus around 1) fall, new faculty videos could be screened with a reception; 2) recognitions and awards, particularly external recognitions, could be identified at the all-faculty meeting. 3) feature the newly tenured/promoted faculty and the book they've chosen to the library and acknowledge their mentor(s) 4) feature newly promoted non-tenure track faculty and their mentor (s) Also could ask new faculty and their mentors to stand (to	Dean's Office, Annual All Faculty Meeting	

			show value of mentoring). Ensure diversity of representation, including gender, among those recognized. 4.6 Hold yearly group meetings of assistant professors, associate professors, and FT faculty to provide an opportunity to socialize and to meet with the dean.		
5. Foster faculty citizenship by making transparency and diversity a priority in EMS governance and policy.	A lack of transparency emerges in both the survey responses and in many of the individual comments. women indicated lower agreement that their research and teaching facilities were adequate compared to men. Faculty are often reluctant to be strongly involved in		5.1 Ensure that all policies are transparent and easily available to all (including hiring, tenure, promotion, harassment/discrimination, space allocation, teaching assignments, etc.)	Dean's office, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR, Communications	EMS Admin Fellow project on onboarding proposes recommendations for more purposeful and longer term acclimation of new employees into the EMS community New EMS Website updates
			5.2 Ensure that female faculty are paid equitably to their male peers and that they have access to the same space, resources, promotion, and recognition as their male peers.	Dean, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR	
			5.3 Address faculty workload stress.	Dean/ Department Heads/Institute Directors	

	governance at all levels. This is likely a consequence of elevated stress and high workloads experienced by many EMS faculty, especially in the tenure-line ranks.		5.4 Recognize those who do contribute their time to governance activities, include in annual faculty activity report.	Dean, Department Heads/Institute Directors, HR	
6. Ensure there are effective reporting, investigation, education, and enforcement policies for sexual harassment. Penn State has zero tolerance for any form of sexual harassment.	*sexual harassment is a reality in the lives of women faculty in EMS. This reality is present both through their own personal experiences and through their awareness of the experiences of others.* National data show sexual harassment in academia is most commonly perpetrated by supervisors on lower stature females. Women faculty		6.1 Implement effective reporting, investigation, education, and enforcement policies for sexual harassment.	Dean, Associate Deans, Department Heads, Institute Directors, HR, in partnership with Affirmative Action Office.	
			6.2 Clearly communicate and strongly enforce Penn State's zero tolerance policy for all forms of sexual harassment.		Dean has distributed a statement that EMS will not tolerate any sexual harassment or abuse, including in fieldwork (10-09-17)

	are more likely to be called on for informal emotional and other forms of support in such cases.				
7. Support and enforce efforts for inclusion and diversity by visible and frequent communication of priorities and data.		See additional report notes below regarding climate and isolation Addressing general climate, collegiality, and isolation issues across all EMS faculty and staff will help to address diversity climate issues as well. Attention should also be given to issues affecting staff	7.1 EMS is encouraged to become a campus leader in visibly supporting diversity by publically releasing data on diversity regularly. • 7.1-1 Invest in a staff position to enable the acquisition and analysis of EMS gender and diversity data, national comparison data, and metrics that can be used to evaluate Affirmative Action compliance. • 7.1-2 Include facility with data and data resources as a competency for any staff hire.	Dean, Associate Deans, ADEE, Department Heads/Institute Directors, Diversity Council	

			7.2 EMS leadership is encouraged to communicate diversity and inclusion priorities regularly and visibly to the entire College. • 7.2-1 Issue an annual "state of EMS diversity" report that highlights progress, identifies opportunities and challenges for continued efforts, and reinforces values of inclusion to the EMS community. • 7.2-2 Conduct a comprehensive college climate survey (faculty, staff, and students) and implement recommendations which emerge from it.	Dean, Assoc Deans, ADEE, Department Heads/Institute Directors, Diversity Council, EMS Office of Marketing and Communications	EESI sponsored a series of discussions around inclusivity (fall 2017). In process of conducting a comprehensive College environmental climate assessment (focus groups and ground work Spring 2018, survey Fall 2018, recommendations and implementation plan Spring 2019)

Climate:

Overall, faulty indicate there is a good culture of respect in EMS. However, the pattern of responses clearly show that men were more strongly affirming, while agreement by women was less positive in nature.

All groups indicated high levels of agreement that they feel isolated in their department or unit, although differences are large by rank and gender (Table 17). … The combined responses for the EMS institutes (Energy, EESI, Dutton) and the department of Energy and Mineral Engineering all had pronounced rates of isolation. More than 60% of all respondents in these categories indicated some form of agreement with the statement of isolation. Although other units had lower rates, the levels of agreement are still notable: 40% Geosciences responses indicated some form of agreement, and rates were within 20-30% for remaining departments. … The respondents indicated modest to low levels of agreement that there are opportunities to be included in informal networks (Table 17). These response rates show strong differences by gender, with women consistently less likely than their peers to agree they are included in networks. Faculty expressed similar patterns of responses about networking, access to professional development, and mentoring by unit (Table 18). These data emphasize the need to build stronger connections within units and across the EMS faculty community, and investments in professional development and mentoring resources provide an

opportunity to do so. *In summary, both men and women respondents experience isolation within their departments or units at high rates. About one in four men and half of all women currently experience isolation. … Many faculty within EMS feel excluded and less connected to each other and to the organization as a whole. This is a significant finding, and it raises the concern that respondents experience subtle interpersonal discriminatory behaviors or incivility that are known to cause isolation within organizations. Both individuals and organizational cultures suffer from occurrences of interpersonal discrimination, and the committee strongly urges the College to address factors that contribute to feelings of isolation by all faculty.*

The majority of women at all ranks, and especially tenured women, have considered leaving EMS. This finding reinforces the concern that emerges from EMS employment data regarding retention, and survey results that suggest women have a generally lower perception of respect, lower rates of satisfaction with the institution, greater feelings of isolation, and lower perceptions of fairness in service and teaching responsibilities and in the promotion process.

Additionally, the College has had success in the areas noted below, and should continue efforts in these areas:

Commended for:

The Department of Material Science and Engineering is recognized for its substantial gains in the proportion of women.

The committee commends the persistent effort which has successfully increased the number of women in these highly visible and influential positions of leadership. (Associate Deans, Department Heads, Center Directors)

Overall, the culture of faculty recognition in EMS contrasts highly favorably with national trends. The committee commends EMS for recognizing both men and women as top contributors to the College mission of excellence in research, teaching, and service. …

Overall, the number of women invited to speak in EMS seminars has increased over the last several years, and gender representations among speakers for different fields compare well to national availability data.

Pre-tenure faculty appear to be getting better information and have a stronger sense of fairness about the promotion process.